



RIPE NCC

RIPE NETWORK COORDINATION CENTRE

Digesting the results of the ITU's 2022 Plenipotentiary Conference

Bastiaan Goslings | 27 October 2022 | Cooperation WG RIPE85



Why the ITU?

Recap: Why and how do we engage?



- Our objectives:
 - Ensure ITU remains within its mandate: not the place to develop Internet standards
 - Promote multistakeholder approach; support open Internet model
 - Provide technical expertise to member states
- RIPE NCC is a sector member of both ITU-T and ITU-D
- Contribute to:
 - Regional coordination groups
 - Study Groups (e.g. SG11 on protocols, SG13 on future networks and SG20 on IoT)
 - Major conferences
 - Informal Experts Groups



Plenipotentiary 22

The ITU Plenipotentiary Conference



- Held every four years
 - Main decision-making body of ITU; determines overall direction: four year strategic and financial plans
 - Elects senior management positions, a.o. Secretary-General and Deputy
 - More than 2,000 participants from 193 member states, including ministers
 - A number of so-called ‘Internet resolutions’
 - Negotiations between member states as well as regions, based on prepared and published regional positions

ITU Plenipotentiary Conference 2022



- Three (!) week conference, 26 September - 14 October
 - Week 1: elections, networking, receptions
 - Week 2: formation of so-called ad hoc groups and start work on resolutions to reach consensus on texts
 - Week 3: finish ad hoc work, formally agree on text in plenary > no consensus generally means no change



Resolutions: before the conference

- Regional deliberations to determine positions and room for negotiation / bargaining
- Common regional proposals submitted before the conference
- Analyse differences before the conference
- For us: also alignment with other I* orgs

Resolutions: at the conference



- Forming of ad hoc groups, based on themes
 - Group for ‘**Internet-related Resolutions**’: focus for RIPE NCC, which gives input but is not directly involved in negotiations
- Per resolution different proposals for text put into one doc and every part of text is negotiated to reach consensus
- Bargaining, wordsmithing
 - Many additional ‘informals’, one-on-one’s, WhatsApp groups



Internet-related Resolutions

Most relevant



- Res **101**: Internet Protocol-based networks
- Res **102**: ITU's role with regard to international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet and the management of Internet resources, including domain names and addresses
- Res **133**: Role of administrations of Member States in the management of internationalized (multilingual) domain names
- Res **146**: Period review and revision of the International Telecommunication Regulations (ITRs)
- Res **180**: Promoting deployment and adoption of IPv6 to facilitate the transition from IPv4 to IPv6
- Res **206**: OTTs

** See more details after the presentation slides**

Controversies



We can all agree that we need to 'connect the unconnected' and there is an important role for the ITU to cooperate with other organisations and help member states with best practices, information and data

But: How does that translate into a concrete mandate and a fitting role in the ecosystem at large?

Controversies



- How prominent the reference to the RIRs and other Internet organisations should be (footnote or main body)
- How big a role the ITU should have in Internet governance, specifically in IP address management
- Whether Council Working Group on Internet should be open to all stakeholders or sector members (right now just member states)
- Review the ITRs, revise them, and/or draft new ones, organise new WCIT, or stop work entirely on ITRs at least for the time being

In summary



- *Resolution 101 on Internet Protocol-based networks*
 - Status quo mostly accepted, no additional remit for the ITU in IP-based networks
- *Resolution 102 ITU's role with regard to international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet*
 - Long negotiated resolution; end result being mostly no change
 - Some language on sustainable development, best practices, fostering cooperation and new and emerging technologies added

In summary



- *Resolution 133: Role of Member States in the management of IDNs*
 - Conflation of issues on IDNs being discussed with RIRs and unclarity on universal acceptance > No consensus meant no change
 - New language on accessibility, inclusivity, digital skills and capacity building added
 - Reporting on ICANN GAC activities to ITU Council
- *Resolution 180: Promoting deployment and adoption of IPv6 to facilitate the transition from IPv4 to IPv6*
 - Change from ‘transition’ to ‘deployment’ > Mostly no change
 - New language on role private sector and investment, connectivity, multistakeholderism, best practices and fostering an enabling environment

So, what do we think of the end result?



- All in all we are happy, although proposals tend to return at future meetings
 - (Non) role of ITU in standards setting remains a topic
 - No 'New IP' and/or 'IPv6+' explicitly discussed > but popping up in Study Groups
 - Compromised on referral to I* orgs, and openness CWG-Internet



Any questions? Thoughts?

bgoslings@ripe.net

https://labs.ripe.net/author/suzanne_taylor_muzzin/reflections-on-the-itu-plenipotentiary-conference-2022/



Additional material



For those interested...

- 450 pages of Final Acts
- Adopted resolutions and decisions, which are not treaty-level agreements but provide explicit direction for work to be undertaken by the ITU.
 - Including the so called 'Internet-related resolutions'

<https://www.itu.int/md/S22-PP-C-0202/en>

Res 101: Internet Protocol-based networks



- Some proposed changes:
 - Internet administration organisations (incl. RIR's) in main text, versus removal of existing footnote reference entirely
 - Add 5G, AI, IoT, Big Data, cloud computing, and OTTs as areas for ITU's involvement,
 - Instruct Council to support and engage efforts 'leading to sustainable, secured and stable IP-based networks'
 - 'Sustainable IP-based networks require sustainable and trusted governance of the critical Internet infrastructure resources, including systems providing domain names and Internet addresses'

Res 101: Internet Protocol-based networks



- Results, final text:
 - Internet administration organisations (inc. RIR's) not in main text, remain in footnote
 - Reference to multistakeholderism remained
 - Language around inclusivity not included
 - Adapted: 'requests the three Sectors to continue to consider and update their work programmes on IP-based networks and on migration to ~~NGN and~~ future networks, including strengthening collaboration with other entities and organizations for the benefit of Member States and ITU members, taking into account the impact of new and emerging telecommunication/ICT services and technologies~~emerging telecommunications/ICTs~~,

Res 102: ITU's role with regard to international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet



- Some proposed changes:
 - Internet administration organisations (incl. RIR's) in main text, versus removal of existing footnote reference entirely
 - Opening up CWG-Internet to all stakeholders, or at least (partly) to sector members
 - 'Noting with concern the unfulfilled of Tunis Agenda provisions related to Internet governance which led to a lack of sustainable and trusted Internet governance, including the critical Internet infrastructure ecosystem and domain names and Internet addresses.'
 - Instruct the CWG-I to 'suggest recommendations leading to sustainable, secured and stable Internet critical infrastructure in order to avoid Internet fragmentation'

Res 102: ITU's role with regard to international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet



- Results, final text:
 - Internet administration organisations (incl. RIR's) not in main text, remain in footnote
 - No change with regard to CWG-Internet: remains open only to member states, with open consultations ahead of time

Res 133: Member States and management IDNs



- Some proposed changes:
 - Put Internet administration organisations (incl. RIR's) in main text, and remove the text that one of the reasons for cooperation is to increase the role of ITU in Internet governance, versus remove reference to these org's entirely
 - Instruct the SG and Directors of Bureaux to report to ITU council on the activities of the ICANN Governmental Advisory Committee (GAC) related to this resolution.

Res 133: Member States and management IDNs



- Result, final text:
 - Internet administration organisations (inc. RIR's) not in main text, remain in footnote
 - New text: noting the need for consistent and continuous reporting to ITU council on IDNs given ITU's membership in ICANN Governmental Advisory Committee (GAC)
 - New text on promoting capacity building, information sharing and the exchange of best practices among all stakeholders in the deployment and implementation of IDNs, with a focus on developing countries

Res 146: review and revision ITRs



- Some proposed changes
 - Delete all operative clauses, thank the Expert Group on ITRs and Member States and Sector Members that contributed, dissolve the Expert Group and resolve, taking into account the widely diverging views to neither hold a new WCIT nor take further action to review or revise the ITRs unless there is broad consensus
 - Establish a CWG-ITRs to propose new draft set of ITRs
 - Reconvene the Expert Group ITRs, continue reviewing ITRs
 - Develop a new set of ITRs focusing on high level principles with a view to harmonise the 1988 and 2012 versions

Res 146: review and revision ITRs



- Results, final text:
 - Added: ‘Resolves to continue consideration of issues relating to the ITRs, including their review’
 - Remains: ‘Instructs the SG to reconvene an EG-ITR, open to the ITU Member States and Sector Members’ (...)
 - Submit the final report of EG-ITR to the 2026 plenipotentiary conference with the Council's comment
 - The 2026 plenipotentiary conference is invited to consider the EG-ITR report and take necessary action, as appropriate to consider the EG-ITR report and take necessary action, as appropriate

Res 180: deployment and adoption of IPv6



- Some proposed changes:
 - Remove text stating that the goal of collaboration and cooperation is to increase the role of ITU in Internet governance, modify text to focus studies on usage of IPv6 instead of allocation
 - Internet administration organisations (incl. RIRs) in main text versus removing entirely
 - Add ‘in order to achieve an optimal distribution of resources’ to resolves section as a reason to continue the studies of IP address allocation
 - Text on capacity building, competition, private investment, best practices, multistakeholderism

Res 180: Promoting deployment of IPv6



- Result, final text:
 - ‘Adoption’ and ‘transition from IPv4 to IPv6’ removed from title, Internet administration organisations (incl. RIRs) not in main text, remain in footnote, but emphasis for ITU to cooperate with other organisations is added
 - Text added on role private sector, and academia, with regard to investment and solving deployment challenges
 - New text added, ‘considering that that in the deployment of IPv6, it is important to pay attention to the normal functioning of IPv4 based technologies’
 - New text on importance of capacity building, sharing best practices including multistakeholder coordination

Res 206: OTTs



- Some proposed changes:
 - No change at all
 - Recognise OTT Voice Bypass as a growing source of losses for international inbound voice revenues
 - Encourage OTT's financial contribution to infrastructure development especially in developing countries, call for the SG to assist Member States in establishing legal and regulatory frameworks for provision of OTTs
 - Call for collaboration between member states, telecom operators, OTT providers to eradicate fraudulent use of OTT applications which directly impacts the business of telecom operators, the state economy and quality of call service

Res 206: OTTs



- Result, final text:
 - No change!

Other resolutions worth mentioning...



- **Resolution 130:** *Cybersecurity (page 144 Final Acts)*
- **Resolution 139:** *Bridging the digital divide and build an inclusive information society (page 197 Final Acts)*
- **Resolution 140:** *ITU's role in implementing WSIS outcomes and the 2030 agenda for Sustainable Development (page 207 Final Acts)*
- **New draft Resolution on AI (page 381 Final Acts)**